



FIRST DRAFT
9/4/2025

Town of Middlebury . Ilsley Library Renovation and Expansion Project

1924 HISTORIC ROOF REPLACEMENT EVALUATION MATRIX

SYSTEM ASSEMBLY DESCRIPTION

FIRST DRAFT 9/4/2025		1	2	3	4	5	
		EXISTING ROOF	Per HP SECRETARY STANDARDS	SBARDELLA PROPOSAL	HP Modified	Standing Seam METAL	
EVALUATION CRITERIA	A	COST in \$ per SQUARE	unknown	TBD	TB verified	TBD	TBD
	B	HP COMPLIANCE	Compliant original	Compliant	use of plywood discouraged, may affect grants	Likely compliant	Accepted HP alternative to slate
	C	ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE	75-100 years, dependent upon maintenance	75-100 years, dependent upon maintenance	TBD	75-100 years, dependent upon maintenance	40-80 years, dependent upon materials used
	D	STRUCTURAL INTEGRITY	no professional analysis	no professional analysis	no professional analysis	no professional analysis	no professional analysis
	E	EASE of MAINTENANCE	challenging	no change - challenging	no change - challenging	no change - challenging	less maintenance
	F	WATER & ICE Performance	history of leaks, gutter failure, compounded by site srainage	TBD			likely better than slate, with proper guards
	G	PUBLIC AESTHETIC APPEAL	traditional likely preferred	traditional expectation, likely prefer no change	no visual change from existing	no visual change from existing	may be more acceptable as companion to Town Offices and lower cost
	H	LIKELY WARRANTY	n/a	TBD			